PAPERS AND MONOGRAPHS OF THE FINNISH INSTITUTE AT ATHENS VOL. XIX

OTTOMAN INTIMACIES, BALKAN MUSICAL REALITIES

Edited by Risto Pekka Pennanen, Panagiotis C. Poulos and Aspasia Theodosiou

OTTOMAN INTIMACIES, BALKAN MUSICAL REALITIES

PAPERS AND MONOGRAPHS OF THE FINNISH INSTITUTE AT ATHENS VOL. XIX

OTTOMAN INTIMACIES, BALKAN MUSICAL REALITIES

Edited by
Risto Pekka Pennanen, Panagiotis C. Poulos and
Aspasia Theodosiou

HELSINKI 2013

ISSN 1237-2684
ISBN 978-952-67211-5-6

Printed in Greece by Alphabet SA, Athens.

Cover: A scene from a Bosnian café: a postcard from circa 1910 (Historical Archive of Sarajevo, HAS sig. 0031).

Layout: Laura Ivaska, Saara Kallio and Jari Pakkanen

Contents

Section III: Ottoman Echoes and the Current Mediaspace

"Fantasia Repertoire": Alaturka, Arabesk and Gypsy Musicians in Epirus, Greece

Aspasia Theodosiou

Identity and Musical Plays

In considering the relationship between music and identity, one could easily take as a point of departure the widely known social constructivist thesis that accepts music as constructing social or cultural identities, or sees the valuation of a certain musical genre as constituting a kind of musical identification.[1] Against this background and in the light of the already established scheme of the "logic of identity",[2] such a theoretical underpinning could further lead to various forms of differentiation: distinct, clearly bounded and explicitly different musical genres could emerge, along with their relevant identifications.

Taking as a point of departure Hall's analysis of the "organic relationship between two senses of play" – musical play, and the play related to diasporic dispersed and unsettled Caribbean identities[3]– my aim is to reflect upon the kind of identity/identification that is expressed and constituted in and through a musical practice and/or a musical "genre", especially in case of the Roma and their music. Against this background, I will explore briefly, and in ethnographic terms, the emphasis put on the Eastern/Oriental/Ottoman (*anatolitiki*) musical practice by the Gypsy musicians in Parakalamos (NW Greece), as well as the way this is understood and conceptualized within the sphere of their musical choices.[4]

Two separate issues lie in the background of such an exploration: firstly, the recent additions to the field of Balkan-Gypsy music, and their reflections in the sphere of world music. By focusing on the use of "Gypsy music" as a powerful means of exoticizing all music types in the Balkans, I raise the importance of the process of branding[5] in relation to the issue of the Roma visibility, their simultaneous appropriation and erasure.[6]

Secondly, I draw on the historical process of identification in relation to the Gypsy musicians of my ethnography. I argue that the absence of/the inability to construct a "genre" around their "Eastern" musical practice, and the visibility and branding that such a genre could guarantee for them, has to be approached through a complex lens: as a product of a dynamic process of negotiation/articulation between themselves, their various cultural attributes (place, past, others) and modernity. Furthermore, the possibilities of understanding this complex phenomenon as yet another attempt by Gypsy musicians to foreground the very process of producing music and of rendering themselves musical agents and historical subjects will be explored.

---

[1] E.g. Frith 1996; Middleton 1990.
[2] Rouse 1995.
[3] Hall 1990, 223.
[4] I conducted my fieldwork over different periods; the longest one was during my PhD (1999–2000). For their constructive criticism I would like to thank the participants in the international conference *Popular Culture in Greece and Turkey* (Volos, June 2010), as well as Panagiotis Poulos and Risto Pekka Pennanen.
[5] Lury 1993.
[6] Szeman 2009, 114.

The Setting and the People

In the "neighbourhood of musicians", as Nea Zoi in Ioannina[7] is widely known, the construction of the new main road and the water and sewage facilities – a result of the recent inclusion of the settlement in the city plan – has resulted in a chaotic situation. The illegal buildings of the neighbourhood are nothing more than the product of the rapid urbanization process that took place during the 1970s throughout Greece. It was during the same period that many families moved from the village of Parakalamos (in NW Ioannina, near the Greek-Albanian border), following the more general migratory trend, and started settling down in Nea Zoi.

Next to the squashed, gaily coloured little houses, several freshly washed cars came to tell me of the whereabouts of the neighbourhood's young men who did not have any gigs that night. It was growing dusk and almost everybody was out in the bustling street. A crowd of boys of every age and men stood next to a flashy car, listening to the new CD Giorgos, the car owner, had just finished recording from the TRT channel (Türkiye Radyo Televizyon): "the Turkish channel plays very good music" Giorgos said. Before I even started to wonder about TRT, I noticed many satellite dishes adorning the roofs of the surrounding houses. A bit further the soundscape of the neighbourhood is a bit different; "this music is for the men, the musicians", I was told. As for the girls of the quarter, their taste in music is different, as it is the music of the Latin American soap operas that prompts them to dance on the nearby verandas. They also dance the *Tsifteteli*,[8] some of the older women quickly added: "at our wedding parties, for the eyes of the young men."

Elias Chaligiannis's house is next to the main road that is under construction. In the rather spacious courtyard, Katina, Elias's wife, drenched the cement so that the dust of the constructions works settled. Elias was walking up and down, while trying something on his clarinet. It seemed a difficult phrase; he was playing something "from the 'God', Vasillakis Saleas",[9] as he explained to me later. Before I actually met him in person, many of my Gypsy friends in Parakalamos had referred to "his fantasia, and *Tsifteteli* tunes" as well as to his almost constant offers to play at their weddings: "I cry when I listen to Elias playing", I was repeatedly told by his cousin, Stamato, who continued: "My Thomas is also good but Elias is unbeatable in this style of playing. Like a proper Turk."

The artistic value that Elias and many other musicians (mainly young and middle aged), attribute to what I term the "fantasia repertoire", although recognized by everybody, is more often than not hotly debated and a topic of intense discussion among musicians. Among the Parakalamos Gypsies, the performance of this specific repertoire is seen in a very positive light, while at the same time they point to the importance of "local" music, the music that established them as musicians, "our fathers' songs" as they say. For Dimitrakis, one of my Gypsy friends in the village, "the musicians in Nea Zoi are indeed our relatives; yet, they have become like *Tsiganoi*. You go to the neighbourhood and you cannot listen to a good traditional song anymore. All boys learn only how to play *Tsifteteli* and if they are asked to play a Parakalamos tune, they consider it of lower value." Similar points were also raised by Nikolas, Elias's father.

---

[7] Ioannina is the biggest city in Epirus (NW Greece).

[8] As it can be discerned by its name, this is the bellydance rhythm that, in the Balkans, is usually known as *çiftetelli*.

[9] See Saleas 2008 for one of the most popular tunes performed by Vassilis Saleas and composed by Stamatis Spanudakis.

While Elias was rehearsing in his courtyard, Nikolas approached and made some comments on "Saleas's fantasia", the musical theme played: "these songs do not appeal to the *Balame* (non-Gypsies in Gypsy terms) – to the majority of them anyway; and the reason is that they do not know anything about music: if you are not a musician yourself, you won't understand what Saleas plays; this is a Turkish way of playing" Nikolas points out. He continued:

> Well, once we were playing somewhere in the Peloponnese, near Patras, you know, where *Tsiganoi l*ive. And there was competition [*antipalia*]: just opposite the place we performed, a *Tsiganoi* wedding was taking place. Elias started playing things, like those [songs] of Saleas and Bekos, *Tsifteteli* tunes, fantasias... the rest of the band started playing Arabic... and in very little time the place was crowded with *Tsiganoi* people. That was a real disaster. The *Balame* people who invited us did not like such playing. I had to stop the band. Elias gets carried away and plays in a selfish way, he plays what he likes. This is not a professional attitude. I do agree that this is good music, but things are getting worse and worse among the young generation of musicians. And in a few years they will forget all music related to their grandfathers. And then people will be totally right in considering us as *Tsiganoi.*

In answer to my question, as to whether he always counted this specific repertoire as "their music", Nikolas suggested:

> All the music we play is ours, isn't it? Twenty to thirty years ago nobody played like that. And young musicians are certainly right in refusing to play the same things over and over again. They listen to different things, their mind opens up, and this is good. But the good players, like our fathers and grandfathers, can play the Alaturka and the fantasia and express it in our traditional, local Epirot songs. The problem now is that the young musicians do not know the old way of playing and they miss out a lot. In Parakalamos, the village, they retain something of the old way. Yet, frankly speaking they have not made significant progress as musicians. They are stuck in the mud of the Libuzda.[10]

Facets of "Belonging"

A series of issues emerged from the ethnography presented above. The historical link between the process of constructing Gypsy musicians' belonging and the village of Parakalamos brings to the fore a multifaceted articulation, variously entrenched through the relationship between place, people and music; furthermore, it calls for alternative ways of conceiving the self and identity/identification. In this light I employ the term "Gypsy" (*Yiftos)* exclusively, and not "Roma" and/or *Tsigganoi*,[11] when referring to my ethnographic subjects. Such a choice does not *a priori* preclude the widely known derogatory aspects of the term, but allows for their negotiation through the medium of place and music. Moreover, the usage of the term "Gypsy" (*Yiftos)*, as a synonym for settled musicians, is widely known and employed in all of northern Greece,[12] a meaning that is usually

[10] Libuzda is the name of a local river in the Parakalamos area.

[11] The introduction of the term "Roma" in the Greek public sphere is relatively recent and can be explained through the wider processes of identity politics within the European Union.

[12] See also Blau *et al.* (2002, 95) for a similar point.

attributed to the term *Tsigganoi* in southern Greece.[13]

At the core of Gypsy musicians' belonging, a series of ambiguities is performed, constituting, as I have discussed in detail elsewhere, the idiom of "double marginality".[14] Being nomadic in the past, Gypsies settled permanently in Parakalamos rather recently (after World War II). Yet, they form a key element of the constitution of Parakalamos as a place: even before their settlement there, they already had strong affinities with the village during their nomadic routes across the area of the Greek Albanian border. Furthermore, the time of their settlement is crucial, as they settled in Parakalamos before most of the other non-Gypsy villagers. It is worth noting also that the general understanding of Parakalamos in the area is that of a "Gypsy" or "musicians" village, even if Gypsies do not amount to more than 10% of its entire population. What is more, their association with the trope of movement, an element widely exercised in the border area especially during Ottoman times,[15] allows for their recognition as local but not indigenous.[16] Finally, their Muslim affiliation in the past,[17] their becoming Christians and Greeks in the context of the newly established Greek nation-state,[18] renders them as "new ethnic subjects", who somehow became similar to the other peoples in the border area. Yet, they also remained different.

Thus, it is the articulation of a series of layers, the Ottoman and the more recent national past, as they are mediated in and through the area's marginal location, that constitute Gypsies as "dishevelled selves"[19] in relation to the rest of the peoples in the area – both Gypsies and non Gypsies. It is on the basis of such a "dishevelled" identity that their "dishevelled" alterity, or their "double marginality", are consolidated mainly through the medium of music.

It is a sense of belonging that is constituted through fragmentation, dishevel-ness and deficiency in relation to the hegemonic idiom of belonging; these elements gain their significance through Gypsies' difference. With music as their key cultural expression,[20] such a difference is often understood within an essentialist framework: to put it differently, the relationship between Gypsies and music is reified, as music is seen as a "natural" part of their existence. Yet, the idiom of fragmentation and dishevelment allows for an articulation of their belonging through exclusively relational terms: as part of the place, the self, the everyday life in the village and their long co-residence with the *Balame* of the village.

In other words, at every moment of identification there is a series of articulations,

---

[13] For a broader discussion of the designations/terms used in the Greek context, see Hunt 1996; Blau *et al.* 2002; Greek Ethnological Society 2002; Trubeta 2001; *id*. 2008.

[14] Theodosiou 2004; *id*. 2008; *id*. 2009.

[15] See Green (2005, ch. 2) for a more detailed discussion of the issue of movement in the area of the Greek-Albanian border.

[16] Given the predominance of the trope of movement in the area during Ottoman times (e.g. Green 2005), it was the kind of movement that mattered the most and worked as an identity marker for various groups.

[17] The ethnographic term used is *Turkoyiftoi* ("Turkish Gypsies") in contrast to the *Romiogyftoi* or *Christianoyiftoi* ("Christian Gypsies") of the neighbouring villages. This does not indicate a national identification, but a religious one. See Kokolakis 2003 and Gogos 1995.

[18] Epirus was incorporated into the Greek nation-state in 1913.

[19] Todorova 2009, 14.

[20] Gypsies' "natural" musicality constitutes a form of established knowledge and its genealogy can be traced back to a whole range of representations (i.e. literature, opera, etc.), often embraced by Roma themselves. See, for example, Trumpeter 1992.

so that it is almost impossible for their belonging to be cut from the networked interrelationality[21] and become articulated as a fixed attribute of their identity. Parakalamos' Gypsies' "double marginality", their simultaneous similarity and difference, does not allow for their investment[22] in a specific position/identity, in just one version/quality of the subjects' positionality. It does not allow the entrenchment of "difference" and the construction of a master narrative about themselves in a clear and coherent way. Each positionality/identity taken up is multiply refracted through their intersubjective relationship with place and music, and thus absorbs different qualities.[23] "The double marginality" is, therefore, a rather complex condition that is summarized as their inability/lack of desire to constitute an "-ism" or to be "identitied",[24] as a condition of an ambiguous marginality.

Due to lack of space I cannot delve into the complex field of issues generated by the way the idiom of ambiguous marginality is constituted and experienced around their musical practice: differences between Parakalamos and Nea Zoi, generational gaps etc. In the following paragraphs I will bring to the fore the articulation of this idiom through the use of what I will call the "fantasia repertoire".

Arabesk and Epirot *Alaturka*

Elias's case certainly raised a multiplicity of issues; yet, in what follows I will more specifically focus upon his "Eastern" repertoire, which also constitutes the chosen facet of musical art for the majority of the young generation of Gypsy musicians in Nea Zoi. The Greek musicians they refer to include well-known and established names, in the field of discography and more generally, like Vassilis Saleas[25] and Lefteris Zervas.[26] The latter actually constitutes a unique case, as he originally comes from Parakalamos.[27]

For the musicians whom I worked with, what unites all those "artists" is their "Turkish" or *alaturka* style,[28] as they call it. Their references extend beyond the above names to include renowned musicians in the field of arabesk in Turkey: İbrahim Tatlıses, Zeki Müren, Bülent Ersoy, as well as Turkish musicians of Gypsy origin, like Şükrü Tunar.[29]

After a storm of applause and cries of appreciation, descriptions like "a Turk-

---

[21] Cf. Strathern 1996.

[22] For Hall (1996, 6) the process of identification does not simply presuppose interpellations, but also investments on behalf of the subject: in his own words, "The notion that an effective suturing of the subject to a subject-position requires, not only that the subject is "hailed", but that the subject invests in the position, means that suturing has to be thought of as an *articulation*, rather than a one-sided process, and that in turn places *identification*, if not identities, firmly on the theoretical agenda".

[23] Theodosiou 2010.

[24] Boon 1999, 208.

[25] Here, it is worth mentioning Saleas's co-productions with several well-known Turkish musicians, such as Hüsnü Şenlendirici and of course his popularity in Turkey. See, for example, Saleas and Şenlendirici 2012.

[26] See Zervas 2007.

[27] See Theodosiou (2007) for a more detailed analysis of the Zervas concert in Parakalamos. Reference is also made to other musicians, who are less well-known to the public, usually clarinet players performing in local festivals (*paniyiria*) and in 'clarinet' or *dimotika* ("folk") venues in Athens.

[28] See O'Connell (2005) for an ethnomusicological account of the appropriation of an Orientalist conception of Turkish style in Turkey.

[29] Yet, it is worth noting that for them what is important in the case of Şükrü Tunar is his Turkish identity and not his Gypsy-ness.

ish way of playing", "he plays like a Turk", "he does fantasias", "he stirs my soul", "he transports me to the moon" are nonetheless fragments of an almost established discourse of appreciation, while their ultimate goal is to get "ideas" for their own music playing, when they manage not to get totally enmeshed in the web of high spirits and emotions, of course.

Yet, such aesthetic codes of appreciation and evaluation do not sit at ease with the way they conceptualize the category of Balkan/Gypsy music.[30] I frequently recall the atmosphere of the "parties" organized in the Gypsy neighbourhood of Parakalamos by Yiannis, a Gypsy musician who had for many years in Amsterdam for many years. In these gatherings, CDs of "Gypsy music" were played, as Yiannis stated.[31] Whilst for the kids of the neighbourhood – especially little girls – this music was always received with enthusiasm and dance was passionate, the silence about the artistic quality of such music was, more often than not, deafening. In a similar vein, when we watched Emir Kusturica's film *The Time of the Gypsies*, with some of my musician friends, they commented: "Good playing but emotionless. It cannot lift your spirits. We do not like such music. We are 'Turks'."

How does the "fantasia repertoire" appear from a musical point of view? "When I play in a selfish way", Elias recounted to me, "when they ask me what I like, I do fantasias. I play according to my feelings and then I play *tsifteteli*." Elias's comment refers to the more widely known instrumental pieces in which it is usually the clarinet (and less often the violin) that takes up a solo role. These frequently start with a long improvised piece in free rhythm, and are followed by instrumental or vocal pieces of various origins (traditional, folk, ethnopop, popular or even new pieces) in *Tsifteteli* rhythm.

The similarities between this particular musical practice and the Turkish arabesk are obvious even to the unfamiliar listener. It was during our frequent spontaneous car-stereo listening sessions that my fellow Gypsy musicians and myself were able to spot the "fantasia pieces" of some of the neighbourhood musicians in the arabesk music played: "Elias does this" or "the embellishment is like the one Panos does". On a more general structural level, the form of solo improvisation, *taksim*, that is followed by the rhythmic prominence of *Tsifteteli* can easily be paralleled with the extensive instrumental forms and the opening improvised vocal passages one meets in arabesk music in Turkey.[32]

Similarities can also be seen in the constant rhythmic background – *tsifteteli* – provided by the orchestra,[33] but also in the formation of the overall soundscape through technological applications, such as amplification, sound distortion, and echo. These successive sound overlaps are built to such an extent, however, that when there is a song, its meaning becomes completely obscured and they are often considered to be noise.[34]

---

[30] The category of Balkan/Gypsy music is further explored in the following text.

[31] It was mainly world music productions by well-known Balkan Gypsy groups such as Taraf de Haïdouks and Fanfare Ciocărlia which were played.

[32] Arabesk music is found in the night-club context, where dancing takes place (Stokes 1992, 197). These improvised forms allude to the instrumental sections of the folk musical genre *uzun hava* (literally long tune, free-rhythm vocal improvisation) and those in the popular *fasıl* ("music suite") that is performed at the *meyhane*s ("music taverns").

[33] Stokes 1992, 196.

[34] It is interesting to note the following differences: while in arabesk these improvising forms contrast with the vocal sections due to the predominance of lyrics and consequent song form, in the context considered these forms and the subsequent suites they form are exclusively instrumental, featuring a soloist. Another major difference concerns the structure of the ensemble. The combination of clarinet and/or violin, keyboard, drums

On a primary level, the significance attributed to this particular repertoire, but also its persistent usage in the context of Gypsy weddings, could be explained through a series of ethnomusicological works that discuss the distinction between the in-group and out-group Gypsy repertoire.[35] An interesting aspect of this distinction is reflected in Nikolas's account of the difference between the "selfish" and the "professional" musician: "professionalism" is identified as the ability of the musician to meet the needs – aesthetic and otherwise – of his audience; an audience that is rather different to him. A "selfish" musical practice is about the musician's own aesthetic choices; these can perhaps reflect his community's choices too.

Beyond the obvious problems that the distinction between in-group and out-group repertoire presents,[36] problems that stem from the more general understanding of the relationship between music and identity, such a distinction is easily abolished from an ethnographic point of view. For example, there is no strict analogy between this specific repertoire and particular performance contexts, (i.e. Gypsy weddings). In Gypsy weddings, a series of sub-genres are performed: local music, new-folk repertoire *(neodimotika*) and songs known all around Epirus.[37] The "fantasia repertoire" is frequently presented during the local summer festivals (*paniyiria)* in the wider area of western mainland Greece, where "real revellers" still exist, according to my musician friends. Big names of this type of music are invited to play there, and some of them are invited to play in Nea Zoi as well.[38] Finally, it is worth recalling Nikolas's words: "all the music we play is ours".

Against this background, it becomes evident that these particular musical choices cannot be registered in the framework of a clear-cut binary opposition between "self" and "other";[39] for this distinction is predicated upon/constitutes a clearly divided identity field that does not tally with the historically constructed "ambiguous marginality" of Gypsy belonging.

In shifting my analytical gaze two issues will be discussed further in what follows: firstly, the "Eastern-ness" of the "fantasia repertoire", its relation to the ethnographic distinction between the "selfish" and the "professional way of playing", and the continuities and the discontinuities of this particular musical practice with the more widely known ethnopop musical hybrids of the Balkans. In this light, I will refer briefly to the process of branding taking place in the context of world music industry, which results in the identification of all Balkan music with Gypsy music. Secondly, I will appraise the contrast between the profound visibility of the Balkan ethnopop musical hybrids and the invisibility of the "fantasia repertoire". The latter will be examined within the context of the social

---

and electric guitar point more to a rock band or the wedding bands of socialist and post-socialist Bulgaria (e.g. Silverman 1996, 244). In addition to the aforementioned improvising forms, a significant musical aspect that accounts for the "Oriental" acoustic properties of the "fantasia repertoire" consists of the various timbres and programmed sounds of the keyboard that are exclusively identified with Turkish or Arabic music (e.g. string orchestra sound, or the use of microtonal tuning that differs significantly from that found in Greek folk music [*demotika*] in particularly in Epirot music).

[35] E.g. Rădulescu 2000; *id*. 2004; Gojković 1986.

[36] E.g. Silverman 1996.

[37] Age and gender are significant for the choice of repertoire.

[38] Local and regional radio stations and TV channels ("Blackman" in the Peloponnese, "Radio-Epirus" and "Epirus-TV" in Epirus) very often broadcast recordings and videos from such local festivals (*paniyiria*). Considered to be less traditional than the ones in the more mountainous areas of Epirus, these particular performance contexts fashion a homogenous aesthetic approach to the surrounding space (plastic tents), sonic environment and repertoire.

[39] See Theodosiou 2007 for a more detailed discussion.

poetics of contemporary Greek cosmopolitanism and multiculturalism.

I will argue that the ethnographic discussion about the "fantasia repertoire", its relation to the distinction between the "selfish and the professional way of playing", as well as its inability to constitute a separate "music genre" brings to the fore a very important issue: that of the negotiation of the terms of visibility; for it foregrounds the understanding of the very process of music production and of Gypsy musicians themselves as musical agents and historical subjects. Such an understanding goes against the very nature of branding that has taken place within the realm of the contemporary Balkan-Gypsy music.

Balkans and Gypsy Music: Local Hybrids and World Music

In a recent collective volume entitled *Balkan popular culture and the Ottoman Ecumene,* Buchanan discusses the ethnopop hybrid musical idioms that flourish in the contemporary Balkans and considered them as creative modifications of the Ottoman past that are mainly directed to domestic consumption.[40] Their close resemblance to each other means that these genres constitute "an emergent popular music circuit",[41] and include popular musical idioms such *as muzică orientală* and *manele* in Romania,[42] *chalga* in Bulgaria,[43] *turbofolk* in Serbia and Croatia,[44] Albanian *muzika popullore*[45] etc.[46] In their multipronged analysis, Buchanan *et al.* contemplate the historical and stylistic junctions between these popular music genres, by examining how Balkanism, the Ottoman legacy and the Oriental seem to merge into each other. They pay particular attention to the way the exoticism is expressed, in relation to Balkan popular music practices, in and through various modes: melodic structures and rhythmic patterns associated with the East (equated with Turkey and the Middle East),[47] visual attributes strongly connected to the Orientalist imaginary, and of course the strong presence of Roma musicians.

As Beissinger notes on *musică orientală* in Romania: "it is a formerly forbidden music that is now experienced as exotic, seductive, "Gypsy", Balkan, Oriental, and even Western, as well as contemporary and relevant".[48] The evidence for the relevance of these expressive forms is pervasive and overwhelming: political debates continue to swirl around their production, and parts of the audience are often greatly attracted, while other segments are repulsed.[49] Issues of "class, ethnicity and nation, as well as gender and generational tensions"[50] are sharply brought to the fore; perspectives eloquently discussed in various academic studies.

---

[40] According to Buchanan (2007, 258), these genres were initially not intended for Western audiences. Yet, for Szeman (2009, 112) such a distinction is no longer valid.
[41] Buchanan 2007, 229.
[42] Bessinger 2008.
[43] Kurkela 2007; Buchanan 2002; Kavouras 2010.
[44] Archer 2012; Baker 2007.
[45] Silverman 2007.
[46] According to Buchanan, these musical idioms "must be interpreted as in an intense dialogue with one another […] and in tension with both older layers of cosmopolitanism resulting from European socialism, and competing visions of modernity" (2007, 260).
[47] See also Pennanen 2008.
[48] Beissinger 2007, 97.
[49] See Archer (2012, 191) for a schematic presentation of the criticisms phrased against popfolk musical styles.
[50] Beissinger 2007, 96.

The strong Romani associations of these musical genres, and the fact that Roma musicians are stereotypically considered to be the main agents for the proliferation of these hybrid forms,[51] to such an extent that Balkan popular music is mainly seen as "Gypsy music",[52] is not simply a matter of mere influence. Rather, they owe a lot to the perceived "essential" – due to their origins – Orientalism of the Roma (which in turn wraps the Roma in Orientalist imaginary). It is also due to the common socialist past and communist aesthetics of the area that enforced significant interdictions upon Roma musicians on the basis of their "alien" and "contaminated" musical practices.[53] The post-socialist era is marked by an important turn: the West looks at Eastern Europe, the Balkans and, I would explicitly add, at the Roma, "in search of novelty and originality".[54] Within the Balkans themselves, the identification of ethnopop hybrid musical idioms with the Roma brought about their aesthetic shortcomings as "kitsch", "vapid", "Balkan" and "Eastern".

Beyond their Balkan ethnopop articulations – around which a pan-Balkan aural public sphere is constituted through recording companies, concertizing networks, the new digital media and/or transbalkan music collaboration projects[55] – the relation between Balkan and Gypsy music revolves around another important realm: that of world music.[56]

Within the world music scene the recent veritable "craze" for "Gypsy music" productions bears significant similarities with the emergence of Balkan ethnopop, in so far as it pivots around the Roma's post-socialist visibility;[57] yet, for several authors the political re-evaluation of Gypsy music also owes a lot to the world cinema industry.[58] In the latter the cinematic references are recurrent: Tony Gatlif's *Latcho Drom*, and Kusturica's well-known films, *The Time of the Gypsies* and *Black Cat, white Cat* for example.

On a different note, it has been argued that a wholesale identification of Gypsy music and Balkan music has recently been prominent;[59] such a recolouring of Gypsy music happens within the world cinema, particularly through the portrayal of the "authentic" Balkan Gypsy musician, made famous by Emir Kusturica's films and Bregović's soundtracks.[60] The deployment of the Roma element constitutes a significant means to exoticize and Orientalize every Balkan music genre, given the recurrent reproduction of

---

[51] E.g. Szeman 2009, 110; Bessinger 2007, 130–133.

[52] Although the politically correct term "Roma" seems to have surfaced in the official public sphere, the use of the adjective "Roma" in relation to music (Roma music) is not widely adopted (see, for example, Silverman 2000).

[53] See Bessinger (2007) for a detailed discussion of the interdictions and the marginalization the Roma in Romania have been subjected to during the socialist period. An important element of these ordinances included the policing of their musical practices and their extended musical networks. See also Rice 1994 and Imre 2008, 331.

[54] Imre 2008, 331.

[55] E.g. Stokes 2007; Dawe 2007.

[56] For Imre, the entering of Balkans and Eastern Europe in the world music market constitutes the third phase in the genealogy of the genre (2008, 331–332).

[57] Silverman 2007, 339.

[58] E.g. Szeman 2009; Malvinni 2004, ch. 10.

[59] E.g. Szeman 2009, 112.

[60] As Szeman (2009, 103), among others, points out, many of those groups and festivals seem to imitate the aesthetics (i.e. dress code) adopted in the field of the filmic Gypsy.

romantic-cum-exotic stereotypes[61] in the performances of international festivals.[62] The Balkans come to appear both in group names (e.g. Balkan Beat Box), and as a "logo" for advertising and promoting groups' concerts and tours, thus rendering the participating musicians (Roma and non-Roma alike) as a homogenous and undifferentiated group, despite their different origins. At this point the more general discursive category of Balkanism, as it has been developed and advanced by Maria Todorova, plays an important role: "unlike orientalism which is a discourse about an imputed opposition, balkanism is a discourse about an imputed ambiguity".[63] Following Todorova, if Balkans peoples do not constitute the "Other" in European thought, but rather represent a "dishevelled Europe", a version of a pre-modern self,[64] one can draw important similarities between them and the case of Roma. Iordanova discusses the idea that the Roma represent parts of the West, without though originating in the West; as she argues, they are too close to be cast as entirely remote, though they are marginalized.[65] They are represented as familiar yet dangerous, exotic, although too close to Europe; thus they come to constitute a Balkan variety of what Said calls "the intimate estrangement".[66]

In short, in the realm of the world music scene the articulation of "Balkan and Gypsy music" is constructed around the notion of exoticism that has a Gypsy aura in the Balkans. The same type of articulation is, however, established in the ethnopop musical genres, although in a more Turkish form. In the latter case, it is important to note the following: the role of the common Ottoman past[67] and the Muslim religious affiliation of most of the Roma in the Balkans.[68]

It is interesting that within contemporary academic discourse and identity politics there are various voices that are eager to overcome the thorny issue of whose music it is

---

[61] See Sell (2007, 45) for a discussion of the role of "theatricalized authenticity" and "exoticism" as the ideological basis (symbolic and performative) for the bohemians' cultural activism borrowed from the Roma. See also Iordanova (2008, 308) for an analysis of cinematic productions in which exoticism takes the form of taught reality – according to her, the Roma are used in the filmic genre "rough realism as exotica" as a "metaphoric material" that feature in politically "correct" ways.

[62] See Szeman 2009. In her exploration of the presence of Gypsy music in world music festivals, Silverman (2007) takes into account issues of commodification, authenticity and exoticism. By highlighting the strategic embracement of self-Orientalism by Roma musicians themselves, (Savigliano 1995), she focuses on the way their costumes, for example, add to the well-known stereotype of Balkan Gypsy musician, in order to cater for the expectations of their mainly Western audience. See also Silverman (1996). Although the stereotypes about Roma in literature, music and the Balkan cinema are much discussed (Trumpeter 1992, van de Port 1998, Iordanova 2001), the way the Roma embody such stereotypes or the implications of those for the Roma, musicians and otherwise, are not fully explored (except for Szeman 2009, 100 and Silverman 2007).

[63] Todorova 2009, 17.

[64] Todorova 2009, 14. In a similar vein, Bjelić (2002) argues that the Balkans successfully maintain their "otherness", which contrasts to and is situated outside "Western modernity", due to the threat the area is supposed to pose against this particular form of modernity. See also Green (2005, 151) for a critical appraisal of Todorova's approach.

[65] Ioardanova 2001, 216.

[66] Said 1978, 248.

[67] Buchanan (2007, 260) refers to "an emergent Balkan cosmopolitanism, where the Ottoman Empire's musical legacy has become part and parcel of the local grassroots creative lexicon".

[68] The timing of the establishment of such an articulation is particularly pertinent. In the context of Roma activism, Gypsy music is considered to be the emblematic field of Roma's cultural production and constitutes one of the very few fields for a positive representation of their public identity. The activation of the term "Roma music" instead of "Gypsy music" is also relevant (Malvinni 2004, 55). In using music as a critical tool against nationalistic discrimination and European exclusion – and less frequently as a resistance tool, as in the case of Roma, hip-hop-Roma political marginalization, is strongly criticized (e.g. Imre 2008, 326; Malvinni 2004, 204).

that Roma play[69] and to accept that every musical performance belongs to its creators/performers. Against this background, several scholars have highlighted the simultaneous mimesis, appropriation and erasure of the Roma people that is embedded in the articulation between Balkan music and Gypsy music.[70]

As long as the "Gypsy" stamp remains a way to exoticize any music from the Balkans, concerts and videos like those described here will continue to perpetuate the romantic Gypsy stereotypes, ultimately failing to bring either the Roma or the Balkans – in all their diversity and complexity – closer.[71] What is more, the very notion of "Gypsy music" cannot but be seen as an artificial category that unites "the extraordinarily rich cultural hybridity and inherent transnationality of a variety of distinct and diverse musical idioms" as Imre accurately points out.[72]

I argue that it would be instructive to shed some light on the simultaneous visibility, appropriation and erasure of the Roma people, through the process that Celia Lury calls "branding".[73] In her attempt to understand the phenomenon of "new economy"[74] and the essential restructuring of the conditions of cultural production it brought along, Lury explored the shift from a regime of cultural rights based on the principles of the authorship, originality and creative expression of the generated cultural product, to principles like those of trademark, simulation and branding; a shift, though, that does not imply that the notion of creative labour is any different from other forms of labour. To put it differently, for Lury the attribution of cultural value is based on the process of reception, on what she calls, drawing on Benjamin, "exhibition value".[75] For her, as well as for other scholars, such a shift cannot be conceptualized simply as a facet of the commodification of social relations taking place in today's world, but has to be seen as part of a wider process of branding of "matter previously coded as natural and/or social, a process which has been described as type or kind becoming brand",[76] which is defined on the basis of its exhibition value. Furthermore, the "author-function" is related less to claims regarding

---

[69] The well-known debate between Liszt and Bartók is relevant. It centred around the issue of whether the music performed by the Roma is "theirs" or is it "true Hungarian peasant music" appropriated by them (Malvinni 2004, 9 and ch. 9; see also Brown 2000).

[70] For Mike Sell, the phenomenon of forgetting the Roma, while also mimicking them, is not a recent one, but a gesture dating back in the avant-garde and the bohemian trend of the nineteenth century: "the Roma […] supply even to those who have forgotten them both a conceptual structure and an ontological model for living virtuously and authentically apart from the mainstream. It is by way of mimicking, appropriating, mythologizing, and, ultimately, erasing the Roma that the idea of challenging political authority through fashion, sex, drug use, cuisine, creative expression, etc., came into being" (2007, 45).

[71] Szeman 2009, 114. Her point about DJ Shantel and the song-video clip entitled *Gypsification* (2009, 113) is acute here: the film is set in the streets of Istanbul, the song includes Romanian *manele*-style singing and brass instruments, but with electronic beats, and "Gypsification" represents the link between them.

[72] Imre 2008, 328.

[73] The notion of brand presupposes the possession of an "essence" that extends beyond the product itself. The example of Coca-Cola is very acute, in revealing that what is actually sold is not the product, but its symbolic interrelations, its visibility in the market (Lury 1993).

[74] E.g. Adkins 2005. The list of books discussing the notion of the "new economy" is paramount. Important elements in this discussion are the emergence of the "network society" (Castells 1996), the recession of the significance of social structure (Beck *et al.* 1994), and of every kind of social contracts, even of the products themselves. Instead, in the emerging model of network sociality which Wittel discussed, emphasis was placed upon the relative flexibility and the move from having relationships towards doing relationships and towards relationship management (Wittel 2001).

[75] Benjamin 1970.

[76] Adkins 2005, 115.

the creator's "creativity and uniqueness", and more to the process of reception.[77]

There is an interesting similarity here with the paradox that Adkins detected in the way gender is understood in the "new" cultural economy realm.[78] By discussing a series of approaches that link the "aestheticisation" of the economic and the issue of feminization, e.g. the claim that feminine performances operate as work resources,[79] Adkins pointed out that some workers "may be denied authorship of their workplace identities and the ability to mobilise identity as a workplace resource". For her, this lack of recognition is inextricably interconnected with "practices of naturalisation, normalisation and romanticisation".[80]

In a similar vein, the fixing of the relationship between Roma and musicality through essentialism, although this results in a certain kind of visibility (i.e. Roma as professional musicians), dispossesses them of the ability to claim their "Roma" musical capital as an occupational resource, and instead constructs it as a naturalized part of themselves. Clearly, the problem related to such an assumption can be further highlighted through a consideration of issues related to the musicians' creativity and agency: if Gypsy musicians are rendered unable to mobilise their Roma identity as a workplace capital – for the latter is seen as an essential part of themselves – then their creativity and musical agency will also not be recognizable, with profound consequences for the politicization of the field of the cultural.[81]

In regard to the process of branding (Roma = music = Balkans = exotic = East = Orient), my point of interest lies in the erasure of any emphasis on Gypsy music, its process of production or its complexity, its status as a cultural practice, as well as in the erasure of the Roma themselves as creators of this cultural value. This, as I have suggested, is gaining significance in the context of an increasingly important, contemporary Roma activism and of the struggles around identity politics in the post-socialist Balkans.[82]

Greece and the "Fantasia Repertoire"

I will now return to the "fantasia repertoire", in order to explore its continuities and discontinuities with the Balkan ethnopop musical incarnations. What is more, I will dwell on its importance in the context of the emerging paradigm of Greek multiculturalism.[83]

---

[77] Adkins 2005, 119.

[78] Adkins 2002a.

[79] Adkins 2002a, 58.

[80] Adkins 2002b, 38. "In many service work organisations and occupations it is, for instance, often difficult for women to claim the emotional satisfaction of customers and/or co-workers as an indication of personal effectiveness since performances of what is sometimes referred to as 'emotional labour' are naturalized as part of women's selves" (Adkins 2002b, 38).

[81] I make an implicit reference here to the claim that culture, as a field of resources, is universally available to all and its critique. See, for example, Lury 1995.

[82] If within the brand "Gypsy music", in its Balkan incarnation, (in both versions presented above, ethnopop and world music) there are elements that meet the expectations of both the locals and of the Western audience (authenticity and kitsch, modernity and tradition, Orientalism and Occidentalism), what follows is the appropriation, mimesis and erasure of Roma.

[83] E.g. Tsibiridou 2006; Yiakumaki 2006. The wholesale identification of Balkan with Gypsy music is of course not unknown in Greece. Bands mainly originating in Northern Greece appropriate and mimic Balkan productions and thus they also participate in the well-established by now Balkan-Gypsy trend (see e.g. Cabaret Balkan 2010 and BAiLdSA Band 2012). Pertinent to such a development has been the contiguity, both geographical

The emphasis attributed to the designation "Turkish" or *arabesk* as synonyms of artistic value, the local consumption of this particular musical hybrid, the aesthetic devaluing of such musical choices by the more general public,[84] as well as the identification of this idiom with the Gypsy musicians, are all tangential to the detection of overlaps and similarities among this particular idiom and the Balkan ethnopop musical idioms discussed above.

In sharp contrast to contemporary Balkan popular culture, the "fantasia repertoire" and its associated musical practices and performances have been unable to attain the status of a separate and distinct musical genre and become a brand, and consequently gain the visibility that the latter can bring about.

The "fantasia repertoire" constitutes, according to Gypsy musicians, a significant marker of musicians' "musicality", "virtuosity" and "modern aesthetics". It is relatively popular in the regions where the clarinet "tradition" is extremely important even nowadays (western and central Greece, the Peloponnese and Thessaly), and it is valued and evaluated within and not against this tradition. Thus, it seems far away from the Balkan soundscape of international ethnopop collaborations and networks. What is more, its effect and popularity are very much associated with marginal contexts, such as those of *paniyiria* (local festivals) and the "culture of plastic",[85] as well as with bootleg record networks.[86] There is no current academic interest in this field and of course one cannot but take into account the absolute lack of representation of performances of such repertoire in "established" and "well-respected" concert places or music halls. Perhaps the key for such invisibility is the absence of a specific name for this particular musical practice. The simultaneous usage of a plethora of terms/names, such as "Gypsy" music, "*Yiftoskyladika*",[87] *Tsifteteli* etc. point precisely to its inability to be recognized as a distinct musical genre; the use of the ethnographic term "fantasia repertoire" comes to cater for the absence of a specific name.

In what follows I will try to shed some light on the reasons for this absence and its related issue of visibility, through the discussion of two important points: a more general one related to the wider contemporary Greek society and the situation of Gypsies/Roma within it, and a more specific one relevant to the Gypsy musicians of my ethnography.

Against the background of the "social poetics"[88] of Greek cosmopolitanism and multiculturalism,[89] the existing Romani activism movement has an extremely limited presence in the Greek public sphere. At the same time, the degree to which it has managed to mobilise the separate groups of Gypsies/*Tsiganoi* in a rather concerted way is

---

and musical, of the area (Northern Greece) as well as the extended networks of productions and consumption.

[84] They are considered "kitsch", "Gypsicized", "polluting", "of bad taste", criticized for a collapsing traditionality and authenticity, banality, semi-urbanized qualities and unsuccessful modernisation.

[85] See also Theodosiou forthcoming.

[86] Beyond the official recordings, mainly of the clarinet player Vassilis Saleas, the circulation network of this "genre" consists of pirated CDs that are usually live recordings, as well as internet videos on YouTube and MySpace.

[87] *Skiladiko* (or *Skyladiko*; Greek: Σκυλάδικο "doggy") is either a derogatory term to describe *laiko* or a so-called "decadent" form of folk/pop. See Kallimopoulou and Poulos forthcoming.

[88] Cf. Herzfeld 2004.

[89] Relevant to these issues are undoubtedly what Wilk (1995) and Herzfeld (2004) called the "global systems of common difference" and the "global hierarchy of value" respectively. For a more detailed exploration of the official discourse on multiculturalism in the Greek context see, for example, Yiakumaki 2006.

questionable.[90] While this particular aspect is a complex issue that deserves a separate and more systematic exploration, here I will limit myself to a brief account of the different historical route the different Gypsy/*Tsiganoi* groups in Greece have followed, and of the particularities of the process of their inclusion in Greek society.[91] Furthermore, I will touch upon the different historical predicaments of the Gypsies/Roma in the post-socialist era of the Balkans. The historical predicaments will receive most attention, as these constitute the axis around which the claims of contemporary Romani activism are formed.[92]

In this light, it is worth mentioning that the official record productions falling under the category/genre "Gypsy music" and constituting it as a separate brand are very limited in number and usually make use of the lyrics in diverse Romani dialects as their distinctive marker. Finally, given how pertinent the articulation "Balkans/post-socialist condition/Gypsy music" has become, and the limited Balkanism attributed to Greece (which is somehow activated as a symbolic discourse mainly in the case of northern Greece), one can notice the following: the productions around the Gypsy/Roma signifier frequently appropriate the Balkan "Gypsy" stereotype both in terms of musical composition and orchestration (elaborately ornamented, virtuosic, and often improvisational melodic passages) and in terms of performance practices.[93]

Yet, beyond this more general context, my focus on the case of Nea Zoi in Ioannina and Parakalamos village leads me to argue that the invisibility of this specific musical idiom is constituted and performed through the means of the historical conditionality of the Parakalamos Gypsy musicians; what I have called elsewhere their "double marginality".[94] More specifically, I will argue that the tense ethnographic discussion about the "fantasia repertoire", and the highlighting of a relevant distinction between the "selfish" and the "professional" way of playing points, among other things, to the negotiation of the terms of visibility on behalf of the musicians. It focuses the discussion on the process of music production and of themselves as musical and historical agents, a process that cuts across the very nature of branding.

A series of contrasting elements can be detected in the particularly ambivalent attitude of the Gypsy musicians' community towards the "fantasia repertoire": for example, their incessant attempt to foreground their "musicality", and their "artistry", to use their own words. Such a differentiation refers to their own musical past, which is often identified with the derogatory attitudes of the *Balame* revellers towards them. This differentiation also refers to the non-Gypsy musicians who increasingly break into their performance network and compete against them or their "incarceration" by the very "tradition" they are deemed to serve. Moreover, by putting emphasis on the process of improvisation, the *taximi*, as it is known, and limiting the role of the vocals/singer (which is more often than not performed by non-Gypsies), this particular musical practice gives the primary role to the clarinet player.

In and through the performance of such repertoire, a "community of practice"[95] formed, within which the musicians as modern complacent agents bring to the fore the

---

[90] It is worth noting here that the first Festival of Greek Rom (Roma) was only organized in August 2009 in the ancient theatre of Fillipoi in northern Greece and it had to overcome a series of difficulties (see Platanou 2009).
[91] See, for example, Trubeta 2008; Papapavlou and Koppasi-Oikonomea 2002 and Vaxevanoglou 2001.
[92] See, for example, Vermeersch 2005 and 2006 for a detailed discussion of Romani activism in central Europe.
[93] BAiLdSA Band provides such an example.
[94] Theodosiou 2008.
[95] Lave and Wenger 1991.

use of technology and the significance attributed to the process of listening, while also revealing the importance of virtuosity. In such a community the participants extend the circle of musicians and are comprised also of the smaller group of revellers; the listening subjects who search for their "communitas"[96] in the circle of "good music", "musical knowledge" and "artistic value". This practice is very much in tune with the "dishevelled" exoticism that is historically expressed in and through the musical practice of *alaturka*. *Alaturka*, to recall Nikolas's reference to it, has never achieved the status of a separate repertoire – "all songs can be ornamented with an *alaturka* way of playing[97] and this is what made our way of playing here in Parakalamos different".[98] Their recalling of the past *alaturka* is embedded in their rather recent Ottoman past: "our fathers used to perform for the Ali Pasha harem" they frequently mentioned,[99] and of course their designation as *Turkiyiftoi* ("Turkish Gypsies") Their relation to the exoticism of the East – both in its essentialist version (their "natural" exoticism) and in its historical incarnation through their connection to place and the area's Ottoman history – constitutes a necessary condition for the existence of their own "double marginality", and thus renders them exotic in a "dishevelled" way.

Yet, there is more to it than that. Their incessant wondering about the compatibility of this specific repertoire with their "professional" identity/capacity, refers to the risk of the elevation of this particular repertoire to a separate and distinct genre, and its becoming a brand. Nikolas's and Dimitrakis's reference to the young musicians of Nea Zoi and their emphasis on *tsifteteli* and "selfish" way of playing is apt here: "good musicians but they have become like *Tsiganoi*". What they meant is that the dominance of these specific musical choices has become more and more visible, and interpreted through an exclusive reference to the Gypsies' essentialism, their "inherent" musicality, their radical otherness, that emanates from their "authenticity" as Gypsies. It is this element that is represented here by their reference to the *Tsiganoi* identity. Yet, such an exclusive identification very quickly comes to recant their local belonging, a fact that has significant repercussions for the distribution of social, political and cultural capital.[100] At this point, Szeman's work becomes particularly pertinent. [101] Her analysis concerns the appropriation, mimesis and simultaneous erasure of the palimpsest of difference that comprises the cultural and political presence of Roma in the realm of the current identification of "Balkan-Gypsy" music, and the association of this specific phenomenon with the process of branding.

Their exclusive identification with the local repertoire and the resulting limitations is not a choice either, as Nikolas's condemnation about the village's musicians indicates: "they are stuck in the mud of the Libuzda". In so far as it is related to their role as "local musicians", such an identification entrenches their belonging, while also simultaneously entailing designations of a lack of "musicality" and "professionalism". This identification, nevertheless, draws its significance from a series of elements, more importantly the

---

[96] Cf. Turner 1967.

[97] It is noteworthy that a great number of musicians talk about a "Byzantine way of playing", influenced as they obviously are by the hegemonic discourse on Greek tradition.

[98] Due to its *ala turka* character, the traditional music of Parakalamos is considered different to the traditional music of its surrounding areas (i.e. Pogoni, Zagori) and "of less" value.

[99] Despite the frequent reference to Ali Pasha's court and the role their "fathers" played in it by the elderly Gypsies, there is not enough historical data to confirm such an association. See Brandl 1996 for more.

[100] See Theodosiou 2011 as one example.

[101] Szeman 2009.

marginal position Parakalamos occupies in the realm of what has been called "traditional music".[102]

Epilogue

As a way of conclusion, in what follows I will try to briefly shed some light on the contemporary musical geographies Gypsy musicians are called to dwell upon. These geographies presuppose, among other elements, a balanced mixture of an extensive repertoire, the ability to adapt to the specific needs of the performance context and the ability to establish social networks as well as to articulate a "personal" musical style. It is this last element that constitutes the meeting point between their "professional" and their "selfish" performance practice, but also the point of their subtle, yet, very telling, distinction. Going back to Elias's musical practice and the distinction between a "selfish" and "professional" way of playing, the "problem" for Nikolas, Elias's father, is located in the dominance of the first way of performing over the second. As in the case of *Alaturka*, when the ability to articulate a distinct, personal performance style through the employment of "established" musical codes, (i.e. a Turkish style of playing) is not confined to a particular musical genre, and does not become identified with it, then the musician is in a position to negotiate the terms of conditions of his visibility and to highlight his creativity; elements that compose the notions of "professionalism" and "musicality". [103] Nikolas's point that "all music played by us is our music" virtually affirms not his opposition to the musician's personal style, but rather his opposition to the clear-cut boundaries and identities that often dictate a monolithic identification of the Gypsy musician with what is only a possible fragment of his multifarious musical practice.

The example of Vassilis Saleas, "Vassilakis" as he is known among Gypsy musicians, may help to uncover this fine distinction; "If Saleas is so well-known, it is because he managed to create his own personal style", I was told. The fame of this particular musician does not originate in the visibility of a specific musical "genre" (the "fantasia repertoire"), but in his creativity that becomes evident in all his musical practices, and goes against the clear-cut boundaries of musical genres.

Thus, in so far as the "fantasia repertoire", like *alaturka*, brings together traditional and modern elements and constitutes a manifold hybrid, it establishes another place, where Gypsy musicians are called to negotiate their relationship with modernity and its complexity and their diverse cultural attributes (e.g. their local belonging).

In this light, I argue that the relevance to the ambiguous marginality of Gypsy musicians pronounces this specific repertoire as in opposition to clear-cut boundaries, distinct identities and their essentialist understandings, while also highlighting processes of differentiation, otherness, and "dishevelled" exoticism. To use the words of James Boon: "what makes something truly marginal is its *inability* to become an '-ism' or to be 'identitied'".[104]

The fact that such an inability to identify, or the incessant search for different identifications, finds its space in the liminal field of local festivals (*paniyiria*) cannot be viewed as a mere coincidence. It is in this context that the negotiation of the conditions of

[102] Theodosiou 2006.
[103] Gypsy musicians are exclusively male.
[104] Boon 1999, 208.

their visibility is still happening in ways that the Gypsy musicians can define and control to a certain extent.

References

Adkins 2002a = L. Adkins, 'Sexuality and Economy: Historicization vs Deconstruction', *Australian Feminist Studies* 17, 37 (2002) 31–41.

Adkins 2002b = L. Adkins, *Revisions: Gender & Sexuality in Late Modernity*, Buckingham 2002.

Adkins 2005 = L. Adkins, 'The New Economy, Property and Personhood', *Theory, Culture and Society* 22, 1 (2005) 111–130.

Archer 2012 = R. Archer, 'Assessing Turbofolk Controversies: Popular Music Between the Nation and the Balkans', *Southeastern Europe* 36 (2012) 178–207.

BAiLdSA Band 2012 = BAiLdSA Band, *Live at Gagarin 205*, YouTube http: http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zKQqBFX4-_Y>, accessed 1 May 2013.

Baker 2007 = C. Baker, 'The Concept of Turbofolk in Croatia: Inclusion/Exclusion of National Musical Identity', in C. Baker *et al.* (eds.), *Nation in Formation: Inclusion and Exclusion in Central and Eastern Europe*, London 2007, 139–158.

Beck, Giddens and Lash 1994 = U. Beck, A. Giddens and S. Lash, *Reflexive Modernisation: Politics, Tradition and Aesthetics in the Modern Social Order*, Cambridge 1994.

Benjamin 1970 = W. Benjamin, *Illuminations*, London 1970.

Bessinger 2007 = M. Bessinger 'Musică Orientală: Identity and Popular Culture in Post-communist Romania', in D.A. Buchanan (ed.), *Balkan Popular Culture and the Ottoman Ecumene: Music, Image, and Regional Political Discourse,* Lanham, MD 2007, 95–141.

Bjelić 2002 = D. Bjelić, 'Introduction: Blowing up the "Bridge"', in D. Bjelić and O. Savić (eds.)*, Balkan as Metaphor: Between Globalization and Fragmentation,* Cambridge 2002, 1–22.

Blau *et al.* 2002 = D. Blau, D. Keil, Ch. Vellou-Keil and St. Feld, *Bright Balkan Morning: Romani Lives and the Power of Music in Greek Macedonia,* Middletown, CT 2002.

Boon 1999 = J.A. Boon, *Verging on Extra-Vagance: Anthropology, History, Religion, Literature, Arts... Showbiz,* Princeton, NJ 1999.

Brandl 1996 = R.M. Brandl, '"The Yiftoi" and the Music of Greece: Role and Function', *The World of Music* 38, 1 (1996) 7–32.

Brown 2000 = J. Brown 'Bartok, the Gypsies and Hybridity in Music', in G. Born and D. Hesmondhalgh (eds.), *Western Music and Its Others: Difference, Representation and Appropriation in Music*, Berkeley 2000, 119–142.

Buchanan 2002 = D.A. Buchanan, 'Soccer, Popular Music and National Consciousness in Post-State-Socialist Bulgaria 1994–1996', *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* 11, 2 (2002) 1–27.

Buchanan 2007 = D.A. Buchanan, 'Bulgarian Ethnopop along the Old *Via Militaris*: Ottomanism, Orientalism, or Balkan Cosmopolitanism?', in D.A. Buchanan (ed.), *Balkan Popular Culture and the Ottoman Ecumene: Music, Image, and Regional Political Discourse,* Lanham, MD 2007, 225–267.

Cabaret Balkan 2010 = Cabaret Balkan, *Lianohortaroudia*, YouTube, <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6aiSfNODkaM>, accessed 1 May 2013.

Castells 1996 = M. Castells, *The Rise of the Network Society,* Oxford 1996.

Dawe 2007 = K. Dawe 'Regional Voices in a National Soundscape: Balkan Music and Dance in Greece, in D.A. Buchanan (ed.), *Balkan Popular Culture and the Balkan Ecumene: Music Image, and Regional Political Discourse*, Lanham, MD 2007, 175–192.

Frith 1996 = S. Frith, *Music and Identity,* London 1996.

Gogos 1995 = A.K. Gogos, *Παρακάλαμος*, (A' και B' τόμος), Ioannina 1995.

Gojković 1986 = A. Gojković, 'Music of Yugoslav Gipsies', in J. Bezić (ed.), *Traditional Music of Ethnic Groups – Minorities. Proceedings of the Meeting of Ethnomusicologists on the Occasion of the European Year of Music*, Zagreb 1986, 167–178.

Greek Ethnological Society 2002 = Ελληνική Εταιρεία Εθνολογίας (επιμ.), *Οι Ρομά στην Ελλάδα*, Athens 2002.

Green 2005 = S. Green, *Notes from the Balkans: Locating Ambiguity and Marginality on the Greek-Albanian Border,* Princeton 2005.

Hall 1990 = St. Hall, 'Cultural Identity and Diaspora' in J. Rutherford (ed.), *Identity Community, Culture, Difference,* London 1990, 222–237.

Hall 1996 = St. Hall, 'Who Needs Identity?', in St. Hall and P. du Gay (eds.), *Questions of Cultural Identity,* London 1996, 1–17.

Herzfeld 2004 = M. Herzfeld, *The Body Impolitic: Artisan and Artifice in the Global Hierarchy of Value,* Chicago 2004.

Imre 2008 = A. Imre, 'Roma Music and Transnational Homelessness', *Third Text* 22, 3 (2008) 325–336.

Iordanova 2001 = D. Iordanova, *Cinema of Flames: Balkan Film, Culture and the Media,* London 2001.

Iordanova 2008 = D. Iordanova, 'Mimicry and Plagiarism', *Third Text* 22, 3 (2008) 305–310.

Kallimopoulou and Poulos forthcoming = E. Kallimopoulou and P. Poulos, 'Laiko', in J. Shepherd, D. Laing and D. Horn (eds.), *Continuum Encyclopedia of Popular Music of the World* 13. *Genres of European Origin*, forthcoming.

Kavouras 2010 = P. Kavouras, 'Μουσικές ταυτότητες στα Βαλκάνια: Από το φολκλόρ στο έθνικ. Η περίπτωση της βουλγάρικης chalga', in P. Kavouras (ed.), *Φολκλόρ και παράδοση: Ζητήματα Ανα-παράστασης και επιτέλεσης της μουσικής και του χορού*, Athens 2010, 29–88.

Kokolakis 2003 = M. Kokolakis, *Το ύστερο γιαννιώτικο πασαλίκι: Χώρος, Διοίκηση και πληθυσμός στην Τουρκοκρατούμενη Ήπειρο (1820–1913)*, Athens 2003.

Kurkela 2007 = V. Kurkela, 'Bulgarian *Chalga* on Video: Oriental Stereotypes, Mafia Exoticism and Politics', in D.A. Buchanan (ed.), *Balkan Popular Culture and the Balkan Ecumene: Music Image, and Regional Political Discourse*, Lanham, MD 2007, 143–173.

Lave and Wegner 1991 = J. Lave and E. Wenger, *Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation,* Cambridge 1991.

Lury 1993 = C. Lury, *Cultural Rights: Technology, Legality and Personality,* New York 1993.

Lury 1995 = C. Lury, 'The Rights and Wrongs of Culture', in B. Skeggs (ed.), *Feminist Cultural Theory: Process and Production,* Manchester 1995.

Malvinni 2004 = D. Malvinni, *The Gypsy Caravan: from Real to Imaginary Gypsies in Western Music and Film,* London 2004.

Middleton 1990 = R. Middleton, *Studying Popular Music,* Milton Keynes 1990.

O'Connell 2005 = J.M. O'Connel, 'In the Time of *Alaturka*: Identifying Difference in Musical Discourse', *Ethnomusicology* 49, 2 (2005) 177–205.

Papapavlou and Koppasi-Oikonomea 2002 = M. Papapavlou and E. Koppasi-Oikonomea, 'Εισαγωγή: Τσιγγάνοι και τσιγγανολογία; Λόγοι περί ετερότητας', in M. Papapaulou *et al.*, *Οι Ρομά στην Ελλάδα*, Athens 2002, 9–24.

Pennanen 2008 = R.P. Pennanen, 'Lost in Scales – Balkan Folk Music Research and the Ottoman Legacy', *Muzikologija/Musicology* 8 (2008) 127–147.

Platanou 2009 = V. Platanou, 'Πολύχρωμο τσιγγάνικο πανηγύρι στο αρχαίο θέατρο', *Η Αυγή*, 9 August 2009, <http://www.avgi.gr/ArticleActionshow.action?articleID=481056>, accessed 1 May 2013.

Rădulescu 2000 = Sp. Rădulescu, 'Our Music versus the Music of Others', in M.P. Baumann (ed.), *Music, Language and Literature of the Roma and Sinti,* Berlin 2002, 293–308.

Rădulescu 2004 = Sp. Rădulescu, *Chats about Gypsy Music,* Bucharest 2004.

Rice 1994 = T. Rice, *May It Fill Your Soul: Experiencing Bulgarian Music*, Chicago 1994.

Rouse 1995 = R. Rouse, 'Questions of Identity: Personhood and Collectivity in Transnational Migration to the United States', *Critique of Anthropology* 15, 4 (1995) 351–380.

Said 1978 = E.W. Said, *Orientalism: Western Representations of the Orient,* London 1978.

Saleas 2008 = V. Saleas, *Petrina Chronia,* YouTube, <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BgxufEIu0GQ>, accessed 1 May 2013.

Saleas and Şenlendirici 2012 = V. Saleas and H. Şenlendirici, *Festival international de Carthage 2012*, YouTube, <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AdDAk2wWuqs>, accessed 1 May 2013.

Savigliano 1995 = M.E. Savigliano, *Tango and the Political Economy of Passion,* Boulder 1995.

Sell 2007 = M. Sell, 'Bohemianisn, the Cultural Turn of the Avantgarde, and Forgetting the Roma', *TDR: The Drama Review* 51, 2 (2007) 41–59.

Silverman 1996 = C. Silverman, 'Music and Marginality: Roma (Gypsies) of Bulgaria and Macedonia', in M. Slobin (ed.), *Retuning Culture: Musical Changes in Central and Eastern Europe,* Durham and London 1996, 231–253.

Silverman 2000 = C. Silverman, 'Rom (Gypsy) Music', in T. Rice (ed.), *The Garland Encyclopedia of World Music* 8 (2000) 270–293.

Silverman 2007 = C. Silverman, 'Trafficking in the Exotic with "Gypsy" Music: Balkan Roma, Cosmopolitanism, and "World Music" Festivals', in D.A. Buchanan (ed.), *Balkan Popular Culture and the Ottoman Ecumene: Music, Image, and Regional Political Discourse.* Lanham, MD 2007, 335–361.

Stokes 1992 = M. Stokes, *The Arabesk Debate: Music and Musicians in Modern Turkey,* Oxford,1992.

Stokes 2007 = M. Stokes, 'Shedding Light on the Balkans: Sezen Aksu's Anatolian Pop', in D.A. Buchanan (ed.), *Balkan Popular Culture and the Ottoman Ecumene: Music, Image, and Regional Political Discourse,* Lanham, MD 2007, 309–334.

Strathern 1996 = M. Strathern, 'Cutting the Network', *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 2, 3 (1996) 517–535.

Szeman 2009 = I. Szeman, 'Gypsy Music and Deejays: Orientalism, Balkanism, and Romani Musicians' *TDR: The Drama Review* 53, 3 (2009) 98–116.

Theodosiou 2004 = A. Theodosiou, '"Be-longing" in a "Doubly Occupied Place": The Parakalamos Gypsy Musicians', *Romani Studies* 14, 1 (2004) 25–58.

Theodosiou 2006 = A. Theodosiou, 'Μουσική, Φυσικη/Συμβολική γεωγραφία και οι Πολιτικές της Αναγνώρισης', *Τετράδια 1; Μουσική, 'Ηχος και Τόπος* (2006) 67–80.

Theodosiou 2007 = A. Theodosiou, 'Disorienting Rhythms: Gypsyness, "Authenticity" and Place on the Greek-Albanian Border', *History and Anthropology* 18, 2 (2007) 153–176.

Theodosiou 2008 = A. Theodosiou, 'Marginal Majority and "Dishevelled" Otherness: Debating Gypsyness on the Greek-Albanian border', in B. Petersson and K. Tyler (eds.), W*hose House is this? Majority Cultures and the Politics of Ethnic Difference,* London 2008, 136–152.

Theodosiou 2009 = A. Theodosiou, 'Όταν έγινε ελληνικό: Γύφτοι, Μουσική και Αυθεντικότητα στην ελληνολβανική μεθόριο', *Επιθεώρηση Κοινωνικών Ερευνών,* 128, A (2008) 115–142.

Theodosiou 2010 = A. Theodosiou, '"What Kind of People Do *You* Think We Are?": The *Scenography* of Gypsy Performances of Difference', *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power* 17, 4 (2010) 327–347.

Theodosiou 2011 = A. Theodosiou, 'Multiculturalism and *Catachresis* of Otherness: Settling Gypsies, Unsettling Gypsy Be-Longings', *Critique of Anthropology* 31, 2 (2011) 89–107.

Theodosiou forthcoming = A. Theodosiou, "Πρωτοβουλίες που κάνουν τη διαφορά: μουσικά φεστιβάλ, αυθεντικότητα και αισθητική στα ελληνολβανικά σύνορα', in A. Papataxiarchis (ed.), *Αναθεωρήσεις του πολιτικού: Ανθρωπολογική και Ιστορική Έρευνα στην ελληνική κοινωνία*, forthcoming.

Todorova 2009 = M. Todorova, *Imagining the Balkans,* New York and Oxford 2009 (updated edition).

Trubeta 2001 = S. Trubeta*, Κατασκευάζοντας ταυτότητες για τους Μουσουλμάνους της Θράκης. Η περίπτωση των Πομάκων και των Τσιγγάνων*, Athens 2001.

Trubeta 2008 = S. Trubeta*, Οι Ρομά στο Σύγχρονο Ελληνικό Κράτος*, Athens 2008.

Trumpener 1992 = K. Trumpeter, 'The Time of the Gypsies: A "People Without History" in the Narratives of the West', *Critical Inquiry* 18, 4 (1992) 843–884.

Tsibiridou 2006 = F. Tsibiridou, 'Πολιτικές της Ετερότητας στα τέλη του 20ου αι: η πορεία προς την "πολυπολιτισμικότητα" της ελληνικής Θράκης', *Επιθεώρηση Κοινωνικών Ερευνών* 118, A (2006) 59–93.

Turner 1967= V. Turner, *The Forest of Symbols: Aspects of Ndembu Ritual*, Ithaca 1967.

van de Port 1998 = M. van de Port, *Gypsies, Wars, and Other Instances of the Wild: Civilisation and its Discontents in a Serbian Town,* Amsterdam 1998.

Vaxevanoglou 2001 = A. Βαξεβάνογλου, *Έλληνες Τσιγγάνοι: Περιθωριακοί ή Οικογενειάρχες,* Athens 2001.

Vermeersch 2005 = P. Vermeersch, 'Marginality, Advocacy and the Ambiguities of Multiculturalism. Notes on Romani Activism in Central Europe', *Identities* 12 (2005) 451–478.

Vermeersch 2006 = P. Vermeersch, *The Romani Movement: Minority Politics and Ethnic Mobilization in Contemporary Central Europe*, Oxford 2006.

Wilk 1995 = R. Wilk, 'Learning to be Local in Belize: Global Systems of Common Difference', in D Miller (ed.), *Worlds Apart: Modernity through the Prism of the Local,* London 1995, 110–133.

Wittel 2001 = A. Wittel, 'Towards a Network Sociality', *Theory, Culture and Society* 18, 6 (2001) 51–76.

Yiakumaki 2006 = V. Yiakoumaki, 'Ethnic Turks and Muslims and the Performance of Multiculturalism: The case od Dromeno of Thrace', *South European Society and Politics* 11, 2 (2006) 145–161.

Zervas 2007 = L. Zervas, *Syrto*, YouTube, <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=w2u2x-rsWwQ>, accessed 1 May 2013.

PAPERS AND MONOGRAPHS OF THE FINNISH INSTITUTE AT ATHENS

I Paavo Castrén (ed.), POST-HERULIAN ATHENS. ASPECTS OF LIFE AND CULTURE IN ATHENS, A.D. 267–529. Helsinki 1994. ISBN 951-95295-2-7. xi + 192 pp. + 34 figs. (Out of print)

II Björn Forsén and Greg Stanton (eds.), THE PNYX IN THE HISTORY OF ATHENS. PROCEEDINGS OF AN INTERNATIONAL COLLOQUIUM ORGANISED BY THE FINNISH INSTITUTE AT ATHENS, 7-9 OCTOBER 1994. Helsinki 1996. ISBN 951-95295-3-5. vi + 142 pp. + 2 pls. + 68 figs.

III Petra Pakkanen, INTERPRETING EARLY HELLENISTIC RELIGION. A STUDY BASED ON THE MYSTERY CULT OF DEMETER AND THE CULT OF ISIS. Helsinki 1996. ISBN 951-95295-3-5. i + 175 pp. + app.

IV Björn Forsén, GRIECHISCHE GLIEDERWEIHUNGEN. EINE UNTERSUCHUNG ZU IHRER TYPOLOGIE UND IHRER RELIGIONS- UND SOZIALGESCHICHTLICHEN BEDEUTUNG. Helsinki 1996. ISBN 951-95295-5-1. ii + 225 S. + 115 Abb.

V Arja Karivieri, THE ATHENIAN LAMP INDUSTRY IN LATE ANTIQUITY. Helsinki 1996. ISBN 951-95295-6-X. ii + 328 pp. + 38 figs. + 56 pls.

VI Jaakko Frösén (ed.), EARLY HELLENISTIC ATHENS. SYMPTOMS OF A CHANGE. Helsinki 1997. ISBN 951-95295-7-8. iv + 226 pp. + 16 pls.

VII Olli Salomies (ed.), THE GREEK EAST IN THE ROMAN CONTEXT. PROCEEDINGS OF A COLLOQUIUM ORGANIZED BY THE FINNISH INSTITUTE AT ATHENS, MAY 21 AND 22, 1999. Helsinki 2001. ISBN 951-98806-0-7. iii + 217 pp. + 9 pls. + 3 maps.

VIII Leena Pietilä-Castrén and Marjaana Vesterinen (eds.), GRAPTA POIKILA I. Helsinki 2003. ISBN 951-98806-1-5. i + 130 pp.

IX Maria Gourdouba, Leena Pietilä-Castrén and Esko Tikkala (eds.), THE EASTERN MEDITERRANEAN IN THE LATE ANTIQUE AND EARLY BYZANTINE PERIODS. Helsinki 2004. ISBN 951-98806-3-1. i + 98 pp.

X Petra Pakkanen, AUGUST MYHRBERG AND NORTH-EUROPEAN PHILHELLENISM. BUILDING A MYTH OF A HERO. Helsinki 2006. ISBN 951-98806-5-8. ix + 260 pp.

XI Leena Pietilä-Castrén, THE GRAECO-ROMAN TERRACOTTA FIGURINES OF FINLAND AND THEIR COLLECTORS. Helsinki 2007. ISBN 978-951-98806-6-2. i + 100 pp.

XII Maria Niku, THE OFFICIAL STATUS OF THE FOREIGN RESIDENTS IN ATHENS, 322–120 B.C. Helsinki 2007. ISBN 978-951-98806-7-9. ii + 181 pp. + app.

XIII Björn Forsén and Giovanni Salmeri (eds.), THE PROVINCE STRIKES BACK. IMPERIAL DYNAMICS IN THE EASTERN MEDITERRANEAN. Helsinki 2008. ISBN 978-951-98806-8-6. i + 215 pp.

XIV Leena Pietilä-Castrén and Vesa Vahtikari (eds.), GRAPTA POIKILA II. SAINTS AND HEROES. Helsinki 2008. ISBN 978-951-98806-9-3. i + 133 pp.

XV Björn Forsén (ed.), THESPROTIA EXPEDITION I. TOWARDS A REGIONAL HISTORY. Helsinki 2009. ISBN 978-952-67211-0-1. ii + 276 pp.

XVI Björn Forsen and Esko Tikkala (eds.), THESPROTIA EXPEDITION II. ENVIRONMENT AND SETTLEMENT PATTERNS. Helsinki 2011. ISBN 978-952-67211-2-5. iii + 392 pp.

XVII Martti Leiwo, Hilla Halla-aho and Marja Vierros (eds.), VARIATION AND CHANGE IN GREEK AND LATIN. Helsinki 2012. ISBN 978-952-67211-4-9. iii + 177 pp.

XVIII Jari Pakkanen, CLASSICAL GREEK ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN: A QUANTITATIVE APPROACH. Helsinki 2013. ISBN 978-952-67211-6-3. ii + 127 pp.

XIX Risto Pekka Pennanen, Panagiotis C. Poulos and Aspasia Theodosiou (eds.), OTTOMAN INTIMACIES, BALKAN MUSICAL REALITIES. Helsinki 2013, ISBN 978-952-67211-5-6. xxx + 173 pp.

Distribution:
Bookstore Tiedekirja, Kirkkokatu 14, FI-00170 Helsinki, Finland (fax: +358-9-635 017, e-mail: tiedekirja@tsv.fi)
Papazisis Publishers, Nikitara 2, GR-106 78 Athens, Greece (fax: +30-210-380 9150, e-mail: sales@papazisi.gr)

FINNISH INSTITUTE AT ATHENS